

A Sampling of the Literature on Social, Emotional, and Academic Development

This portfolio of readings reflects the growing momentum behind social, emotional, and academic development (SEAD) in the popular and academic press. It is intended to provide context for the developing national conversation about SEAD, including a glimpse into some of the latest and most often cited research findings that have catalyzed the field. The selection of materials presented here is not meant to be exhaustive, nor an endorsement. There exists a wealth of high-quality evidence for SEAD, and Commission staff will periodically update this list in an attempt make this a living library of SEAD research.

Organization of the Readings

Commission Staff developed brief synopses for a few introductory articles focused on: (1) Overview of SEAD; (2) Impact on Skill Development and Academic Achievement; (3) Impact on College and Career Readiness, Lifelong Well-Being, and Health; (4) Economic Benefit; (5) Considerations for Policy; (6) Considerations for Implementation; (7) Example Framework; and (7) Challenges. Following those readings is a larger sampling of the literature on SEAD, without synopses, that is periodically updated by Commission staff, and which we expect to grow throughout the life of the Commission. We welcome suggestions for research to be added to this list, and will review submissions sent to Michael.McGarrah@AspenInstitute.org.

Overview of SEAD

Teaching Social Skills to Improve Grades and Lives – David Bornstein, New York Times. (July 2015).

This Op-Ed describes the powerful relationship between social and emotional competencies, academic success, and lifelong well-being. The author presents research showing that social and emotional competency in Kindergarten predicts high school graduation, college degree attainment, employment, welfare recipient status, and involvement with the criminal justice system. It details the benefits of integrating social and emotional development with academic learning, including an 11-percentage-point gain in academic achievement, an \$11 return for every 1\$ invested.

When Social and Emotional Learning is Key to College Success – Emmanuel Felton, *The Atlantic*. (March 2016).

This report highlights promising practices and policy innovations to support social and emotional learning in K-12 education. It describes how KIPP charter schools have integrated character education into their curriculum; Two Rivers Public Charter Schools' use of an annual school climate survey to put social and emotional learning at the forefront; and the CORE Districts initiative that attempts to integrate social and emotional learning across ten urban school districts in California.

Why What You Learned in Preschool Is Crucial at Work – Claire Cain Miller, *New York Times*. (October 2015).

This article details new research about the rising importance of social and other noncognitive skills in the labor market. It explains that jobs requiring high technical skill but low noncognitive skill are disappearing as they are increasingly automated. Jobs requiring high levels of noncognitive skill, and especially those requiring both noncognitive and technical skill, are rising. The author points to evidence that noncognitive skills can be taught, and that schools are increasingly adopting methods to do so.

Nonacademic Skills are Key to Success. But What Should We Call Them? – Anya Kamenetz, National Public Radio. (March 2015).

This article addresses the issue of nomenclature in the field of SEAD, providing a brief background on the various taxonomies and the research history behind them. It includes a discussion of: (1) 21st Century Skills; (2) Character; (3) Grit; (4) Growth Mindset; (5) Noncognitive Traits and Habits; (6) Social and Emotional Skills; and (7) Soft Skills.

ESSA Law Broadens Definition of School Success – Evie Blad, Education Week. (January, 2016).

This article provides a background on the new requirement in the federal education law that state education agencies include an additional indicator of "school quality or student success" in their accountability systems. It highlights growing support from education leaders that this is an opportunity to include an indicator of SEAD; however, it also outlines the concerns on the part of researchers that using such measures could be premature.

Impact on Academic Achievement & Skill Development

The Impact of Enhancing Students' Social and Emotional Learning: A Meta-Analysis of School-Based Universal Interventions – Durlak, Weissberg, Dymnicki, Taylor & Schellinger (2011). *Child Development*, 82(1): 405-432.

An analysis of over 200 social and emotional learning (SEL) programs, including over a quarter-million K-12 students, found an 11-percentage-point increase in GPAs and standardized test scores. Students who participated in the programs showed improved social and emotional skills, attitudes, and positive social behaviors, as well as reduced conduct problems and emotional distress. These effects were long-lasting, with all improved outcomes still present 1-to-3 years later. The article includes a background on effective SEL programs practices and finds that schools can reliably implement them.

Impact on College and Career Readiness, Lifelong Well-Being, and Health <u>Fostering and Measuring Skills: Improving Cognitive and Non-Cognitive Skills to Promote Lifetime</u> <u>Success</u> – Kautz, Heckman, Diris, Bas ter Weel & Borghans. (2014). *Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development.*

This review of SEAD programs details their potential for long-term impact, with some programs sustaining effects at a 21-year follow-up. These kinds of results set a gold standard, as they are extremely rare to find in social science literature. Effects include: increased high school and postsecondary graduation rates; lower levels of in-school problem behaviors, dropout rates, and grade

repetition; lower incidences of criminal activity, teen pregnancy, and mental health disorders; improved employment outcomes and higher wages.

Economic Benefit

The Economic Value of Social and Emotional Learning – Belfield, Bowden, Klapp, Levin, Shand & Zander. (2015). *Center for Benefit-Cost Studies in Education: Teachers College, Columbia University*.

This report finds an average \$11 return for every \$1 spent on SEAD programs. It explains the sources of this return, including decreased social costs (e.g., lower dropout and remediation rates; lower rates of criminality, teen pregnancy, and mental health disorders) and increased economic productivity (e.g., higher educational attainment and wages). In addition to detailing the savings and returns on these programs, the authors detail the common costs of them, finding that SEAD programs can be implemented in a cost-efficient manner.

Considerations for Policy

Opportunity, Responsibility, and Security: A Consensus Plan for Reducing Poverty and Restoring the <u>American Dream</u> – The American Enterprise Institute & the Brookings Institution. (2015).

This joint report by the Brookings Institution and the American Enterprise Institute is intended to be a bipartisan consensus plan for reducing poverty and increasing opportunity for economic success in the United States. The report includes a chapter on education, where the authors name educating the whole child—including social-emotional and character development—as a key policy priority. They recommend three discrete policy actions to advance social and emotional learning: (1) Establish dedicated federal funding streams for evidence-based social-emotional learning practice and policies; (2) Develop and implement state social-emotional learning standards for preschool through high school; and (3) Design, at the federal and state levels, centers of excellence that can provide training and technical assistance to school districts implementing evidence-based social-emotional learning.

Considerations for Implementation

The Missing Piece: A National Teacher Survey on How Social and Emotional Learning Can Empower Children and Transform Schools – Bridgeland, Bruce, & Hariharan. (2013). *Civic Enterprises*.

This national survey of teachers finds that there is both broad support and high demand for the integration of social and emotional learning (SEL) in education. Ninety-five percent of teachers believe social and emotional skills are teachable and that all students will benefit from it. However, four of every five teachers report they aren't given adequate time to implement it and four in five want more support to do so. The article goes on to suggest practical supports and policy solutions, and provides an overview of SEL policy, practice, and research, with snapshots of model schools and districts.

Example Framework

<u>Foundations for Young Adult Success: A Developmental Framework</u> – Nagaoka, Farrington, Erlich, & Heath. (2015). *The University of Chicago Consortium on Chicago School Research*.

This report describes an evidence-based framework for conceptualizing the social, emotional, and academic development (SEAD) of children across Pre-K to young adulthood. The framework outlines the foundational components and key factors for successful development. The three key factors are agency,

integrated identity, and competencies, and the four foundational components are self-regulation, knowledge and skills, mindsets, and values. The framework describes the settings and actions that facilitate the development of these foundational components and key factors. Please note: the inclusion of this framework does not signify an endorsement of it by the National Commission. Instead, it is included as one example of the many frameworks that help organize and contextualize the highly complex construct of SEAD.

Challenges

Hard Thinking on Soft Skills – Whitehurst. (2016). *The Brookings Institution, Evidence Speaks Reports,* 1(14).

This report highlights some of the unanswered questions and challenges related to SEAD integration in K-12 education. In particular, the author calls into question whether SEAD competencies and skills can be taught, and points out that the available curricula that integrate social and emotional development with academic learning are limited in scope and clarity. Additionally, the author highlights the difficulty of reliably measuring SEAD competencies and skills. The author suggests that schools focus on: (1) Improving student behavior; (2) Developing guidelines for respectful social interaction; (3) Using measures of soft skills that are naturally-occurring in the classroom (e.g., discipline and participation in extra-curricular activities); (4) Prioritizing intervention for students at highest risk of poor social-emotional development; (5) Remediating or removing teachers with poor interpersonal behavior who harm students; (6) Establishing systems to monitor behavioral elements of the school.

An Extended List of Readings on SEAD

Overview of SEAD

- 1. <u>Making Whole-Child Education the Norm: How Research and Policy Initiatives Can Make Social</u> <u>and Emotional Skills a Focal Point of Children's Education</u> – Economic Policy Institute (2016)
- <u>Outcomes Beyond Test Scores What is Social-Emotional Learning? Preparing Students for</u> <u>School and Life Success</u> – Capella, Blair, & Aber (2016)
- 3. <u>Foundations for Young Adult Success: A Developmental Framework</u> Nagaoka et al. (2015)
- 4. Equal Opportunity for Deeper Learning Noguera, Darling-Hammond, & Friedlander (2015)
- 5. <u>Rethinking How Students Succeed</u> Franham, Fernando, Perigo, Brosman, & Tough (2015)
- 6. <u>Fostering and Measuring Skills: Improving Cognitive and Non-Cognitive Skills to Promote</u> <u>Lifetime Success</u> – Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (2014)
- 7. <u>Transforming Students' Lives with Social and Emotional Learning</u> Brackett & Rivers (2014)
- Academic Learning + Social-Emotional Learning = National Priority Weissberg & Cascarino (2013)
- 9. <u>Education for Life and Work: Developing Transferable Knowledge and Skills in the 21st Century</u> National Research Council (2012)
- 10. <u>We Feel, Therefore We Learn: The Relevance of Affective and Social Neuroscience to Education</u> – Immordino-Yang & Damasio (2011)
- 11. <u>School Climate: Research, Policy, Practice, and Teacher Education</u> Cohen, McCabe, Michelli, & Pickeral (2009)
- 12. <u>Culture and Ethnicity in Social, Emotional, and Academic Development</u> Barbarin (2002)
- 13. <u>Schools That Develop Children</u> Comer (2001)

Impact on Academic Achievement

- 1. <u>Teaching Adolescents to Become Learners. The Role of Noncognitive Factors in Shaping School</u> <u>Performance: A critical Literature Review</u> – Consortium on Chicago School Research, (2014)
- <u>Academic Tenacity: Mindsets and Skills that Promote Long-Term Learning</u> Dweck, Walton, & Cohen (2014)
- 3. <u>Mindsets that Promote Resilience: When Students Believe That Personal Characteristics Can Be</u> <u>Developed</u> – Yeager & Dweck (2012)
- 4. <u>The Impact of Enhancing Students' Social and Emotional Learning: A Meta-Analysis of School-Based Universal Interventions</u> Durlak et al., Child Development (2011)
- 5. <u>A Meta-Analysis of After-School Programs That Seek to Promote Personal and Social Skills in</u> <u>Children and Adolescents</u> – Durlak, Weissberg, & Pachan (2010)
- 6. <u>Implicit Theories of Intelligence Predict Achievement Across an Adolescent Transition: A</u> <u>Longitudinal Study and an Intervention</u> – Blackwell, Trzesniewski, & Dweck (2007)
- <u>Grit: Perseverance and Passion for Long-Term Goals</u> Duckworth, Peterson, Matthews, & Kelly (2007)
- The impact of kindergarten learning-related skills on academic trajectories at the end of elementary school – McClelland, Acock, & Morrison (2006)
- <u>Self-Discipline Outdoes IQ in Predicting Academic Performance of Adolescents</u> Duckworth & Seligman (2005)

Impact on Career Outcomes

- 1. <u>Employer Voices, Employer Demands, and Implications for Public Skills Development Policy</u> <u>Connecting the Labor and Education Sectors</u> – World Bank Group (2016)
- 2. <u>Workforce Connection: Key "Soft Skills" that Foster Youth Workforce Success: Toward a</u> <u>Consensus Across Fields</u> – Child Trends, Lippman et al. (2015)
- 3. <u>The Growing Importance of Social Skills in the Labor Market</u> Deming (2015)
- 4. <u>Closing America's Skills Gap: A Business Roundtable Vision and Action Plan</u> –Business Roundtable (2014)
- 5. <u>Personality Psychology and Economics</u> Almlund, Duckworth, Heckman, and Kautz (2011)
- 6. <u>Non-Cognitive Skills and Personality Traits: Labour Market Relevance and Their Development in</u> <u>Education and Training Systems</u> – Brunello & Schlotter (2010)
- 7. <u>Estimating the Technology of Cognitive and Noncognitive Skill Formation</u> Cunha, Heckman, & Schennach (2010)
- 8. <u>The Impact of Early Cognitive and Non-Cognitive Skills on Later Outcomes</u> Carneiro, Crawford, & Goodman (2007)
- 9. Interpersonal Styles and Labor Market Outcomes Borghans, ter Weel, & Weinberg (2007)
- <u>The Effects of Cognitive and Noncognitive Abilities on Labor Market Outcomes and Social</u> <u>Behavior</u> – Heckman, Stixrud, & Urzua (2006)
- 11. <u>People People: Social Capital and the Labor Market Outcomes of Underrepresented Groups</u> Borghans, ter Weel, & Weinberg (2005)

Impact on Lifelong Well-Being & Health

- 1. <u>Early Social-Emotional Functioning and Public Health: The Relationship Between Kindergarten</u> <u>Social Competence and Future Wellness</u> – Jones, Greenberg, & Crowley (2015)
- <u>How Children's Social Skills Impact Success in Adulthood</u> Robert Wood Johnson Foundation (2015)
- A gradient of childhood self-control predicts health, wealth, and public safety Moffitt, Arseneault, Belsky, Dickson, Hancox, Harrington, Hours, Poulton, Roberts, Ross, Sears, Thomson, & Caspi (2010)
- 4. <u>Connecting Social and Emotional Learning with Mental Health</u> Center for Mental Health Promotion and Youth Violence Prevention (2008)
- 5. <u>Linking the Prevention of Problem Behaviors and Positive Youth Development: Core</u> <u>Competencies for Positive Youth Development and Risk Prevention – Guerra & Bradshaw (2008)</u>
- 6. <u>Enhancing School-Based Prevention and Youth Development Through Coordinated Social,</u> Emotional, and Academic Learning Greenberg, O'Brien, Zins, Resnik, & Elias (2003)

Return on Investment

- 1. <u>The Economic Value of Social and Emotional Learning</u> Belfield, Bowden, Klapp, Levin, Shand, & Zander (2015)
- 2. <u>The Case for Investing in Disadvantaged Young Children</u> Heckman (2008)

Policy

1. <u>Pathways to New Accountability Through the Every Student Succeeds Act</u> – Learning Policy Institute (2016)

- <u>A Call to Action for Inspiring and Motivating Our Children and Teachers to Learn and Grow in</u> <u>Social, Emotional, and Cognitive ArenasA Call to Action for Inspiring and Motivating Our Children</u> <u>and Teachers to Learn and Grow in Social, Emotional, and Cognitive Arenas</u> – Osher & Shriver (2016)
- 3. <u>Development and Implementation of Standards for Social and Emotional Learning in the 50</u> <u>States</u> – Collaborative for Academic, Social, and Emotional Learning (2016)
- 4. <u>Promoting Children's and Adolescents' Social and Emotional Development: District Adaptations</u> of a Theory of Action – Kendziora & Osher (2016)
- <u>CASEL/NoVo Collaborating Districts Initiative: 2014 Cross-District Outcome Evaluation Report</u> American Institutes for Research (2015)
- 6. <u>Social and Emotional Skills for Life and Career: Policy Levers that Focus on the Whole Child</u> Center on Great Teachers and Leaders (2015)
- <u>Opportunity, Responsibility, and Security: A Consensus Plan for Reducing Poverty and Restoring</u> <u>the American Dream: Chapter 5, Education</u> – American Enterprise Institute/Brookings Institution (2015)
- 8. <u>Senate Bill 897 Jesse Lewis Empowering Educators Act</u> (2015)
- 9. <u>Social and Emotional Learning in Schools: From Programs to Strategies</u> Jones & Bouffard (2012)
- 10. <u>Should the Science of Adolescent Brain Development Inform Public Policy?</u> Steinberg (2012)
- 11. <u>Implementation, Sustainability, and Scaling Up of Social Emotional and Academic Innovations in</u> <u>Public Schools</u> – Elias, Zins, Graczyk, & Weissberg (2003)

Practice

- <u>Social and Emotional Learning: Why Students Need it. What Districts are Doing About It.</u> Education First (2016)
- 2. <u>Teacher stress and health</u> Robert Wood Johnson Foundation (2016)
- 3. <u>New Vision for Education: Fostering Social and Emotional Learning through Technology</u> World Economic Forum (2016)
- <u>The Influence of Teaching Beyond Standardized Test Scores: Engagement, Mindsets, and</u> <u>Agency: A Study of 16,000 Sixth through Ninth Grade Classrooms</u> – Ferguson, Phillips, Rowley, & Friedlander (2015)
- <u>Social and Emotional Learning: Opportunities for Massachusetts, Lessons for the Nation</u> ASCD, Rennie Center (2015)
- 6. <u>What Does Evidence-Based Instruction in Social and Emotional Learning Actually Look Like in</u> <u>Practice?</u> – Collaborative for Academic, Social, and Emotional Learning (2015)
- Promoting positive behavior using the good behavior game: A meta-analysis of single-case research – Bowman-Perrot, Burke, Zaini, Zhang, & Vannest (2015)
- 8. <u>Education for Life and Work: Guide for Practitioners</u> National Research Council (2014)
- 9. <u>Teaching the Whole Child: Instructional Practices That Support Social-Emotional Learning in</u> <u>Three Teacher Evaluation Frameworks</u> – Center on Great Teachers and Leaders (2014)
- 10. <u>The Missing Piece: A National Teacher Survey on how Social and Emotional Learning Can</u> <u>Empower Children and Transform Schools</u> – Civic Enterprises (2013)
- <u>Teaching and Learning 21st Century Skills: Lessons from the Learning Sciences</u> Asia Society, Global Cities Education Network (2012)

- 12. <u>Cultural Integrity and Social and Emotional Competence Promotion: Work Notes on Moral</u> <u>Competence</u> – Jagers (2002)
- 13. <u>Fighting for Our Lives: Preparing Teachers to Teach African American Students</u> Ladson-Billings (2000)

Models and Frameworks

- 1. <u>A Framework for Systemic Social and Emotional Learning</u> Collaborative for Academic, Social, and Emotional Learning (2016)
- 2. <u>The Building Blocks for Learning Framework</u> Turnaround for Children (2016)
- 3. <u>Developmental Assets for Adolescents</u> The Search Institute (2016)
- 4. <u>Framework for 21st Century Learning</u> Partnership for 21st Century Learning (2016)
- <u>Safe and Supportive Schools Model</u> National Center on Safe Supportive Learning Environments (2016)
- 6. <u>The Clover Model</u> The PEAR Institute (2016)
- 7. <u>National School Climate Center Framework</u> National School Climate Center (2016)
- 8. <u>The Employability Skills Framework</u> U.S. Department of Education, Office of Career, Technical, and Adult Education (2016)
- Foundations for Young Adult Success: A Developmental Framework University of Chicago Consortium on Chicago School Research (2015)
- 10. <u>Deeper Learning</u> American Institutes for Research (2015)
- 11. <u>Whole School, Whole Community, Whole Child Model</u> Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development (2015)
- 12. <u>A Hypothesized Model of How Five Noncognitive Factors Affect Academic Performance</u> University of Chicago Consortium on Chicago School Research (2014)
- 13. <u>College and Career Readiness and Success Organizer</u> College and Career Readiness and Success Center (2014)
- 14. The PRACTICE Model World Bank Group (2014)
- 15. <u>The Strive Framework</u> Strive Together (2013)
- 16. <u>21st Century Competencies</u> National Research Council (2012)
- 17. <u>The Definition and Selection of Key Competencies</u> Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (2005)
- 18. The Emotional Intelligence Competence Inventory Boyatzis, Goleman, and Rhee (1999)

Measurement

- <u>Measurement Matters: Assessing Personal Qualities Other Than Cognitive Ability for Educational</u> <u>Purposes</u> – Duckworth & Yeager (2016)
- Measuring Elementary School Students' Social and Emotional Skills: Providing Educators with <u>Tools to Measure and Monitor Social and Emotional Skills that Lead to Academic Success</u> – Child Trends (2014)
- Measuring 21st Century Competencies: Guidance for Educators The Asia Society Global Cities Education Network & RAND Corporation (2013)
- 4. <u>Criteria for High-Quality Assessment</u> Darling-Hammond et al. (2013)
- 5. <u>Assessing 21st Century Skills: Summary of a Workshop</u> National Research Council (2011)
- 6. <u>Social-Emotional Learning Assessment Measures for Middle-School Youth</u> Haggerty, Elgin, & Woolley (2011)

- 7. <u>The Utility and Need for Incorporating Non-Cognitive Skills Into Large-Scale Educational</u> <u>Assessments</u> – Levin (2011)
- Preventing Student Disengagement and Keeping Students on the Graduation Path in Urban Middle-Grades Schools: Early Identification and Effective Interventions – Balfanz, Herzog, & Douglas (2007)